# PROGRESS TOWARDS TECHNOLOGICALLY AND COMMERCIALLY VIABLE CO<sub>2</sub> CONVERSION TO OLEFINS, ACIDS AND ESTERS

A techno-economic investigation commissioned by the members of the Carbon Dioxide Capture & Conversion (CO<sub>2</sub>CC) Program

Client Private December 2015





#### The Carbon Dioxide Capture & Conversion (CO2CC) Program

The CO<sub>2</sub>CC Program is a membership-directed consortium whose members are involved in the development, monitoring and utilization of the "state-of-the-art" in technological progress and commercial implementation of carbon dioxide capture/clean-up and conversion. By the direction of the member companies (through balloting and other interactive means), the program delivers a range of timely and insightful information and analyses which are accessible exclusively to members and protected by confidentiality agreements. The objective is to document technically and commercially viable options for CO<sub>2</sub> capture/clean-up as well as its conversion into useful products which meaningfully address the challenges posed by CO<sub>2</sub> life-cycle and overall sustainability issues.

Members receive three in-depth  $CO_2CC$  Techno-economic Reports which are written by leading scientists and experienced industry professionals in areas selected by the membership (via ballot); weekly  $CO_2CC$  Communiqués (delivered via e-mail) which provide the latest updates on technical breakthroughs, commercial events and exclusive development opportunities; and attendance at the  $CO_2CC$  Program Annual Meeting.

The **Carbon Dioxide Capture & Conversion** ( $CO_2CC$ ) **Program** is available on a membership basis from The Catalyst Group Resources (TCGR). For further details, please contact John J. Murphy at <u>John.J.Murphy@catalystgrp.com</u> or +1.215.628.4447 (x1121).



P.O. Box 680 Spring House, PA 19477 U.S.A ph: +1.215.628.4447

#### **CONTENTS**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	XXV
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 THE ROLE OF CO <sub>2</sub> IN THE CHANGING SCENARIO FOR CHEMICAL PRODUCTION	
1.2 SCOPE AND OBJECTIVES OF REPORT	2
1.3 APPROACHES TO USE CO <sub>2</sub> AS ALTERNATIVE TO PETROCHEMICA	L ROUTES5
1.4 SOURCES OF CO <sub>2</sub> AND COSTS	6
1.5 REPORT CONTRIBUTORS	7
1.6 REFERENCES	9
2. CO <sub>2</sub> TO OLEFINS	11
2.1 INTRODUCTION	11
2.1.1 Conversion Routes	16
2.1.2 Advances Towards Viable Processes to Convert CO <sub>2</sub> to Olefins	17
2.2 LIGHT OLEFINS from CO <sub>2</sub> via METHANOL/DME FORMATION	18
2.2.1 Direct Methanol from CO <sub>2</sub> or via RWGS	19
2.2.1.1 Methanol synthesis using captured CO <sub>2</sub> as raw material	20
2.2.1.2 Recent advances in catalysts and reaction mechanism for CO <sub>2</sub> to methanol/DME	24
2.2.2 Olefins	28
2.2.2.1 Developments in the process	33
2.2.2.2 MTO and MTP Technology	35
2.2.2.3 Advances in the catalysts, reaction mechanism and deactivation	36
2.2.2.4 Synthesis with methanol vs. DME as the intermediate	51
2.3 LIGHT OLEFINS via FISCHER-TROPSCH TO OLEFIN (FTO)	53
2.3.1 Direct conversion of CO <sub>2</sub> or via syngas	53
2.3.2 Recent advances in catalysts and reaction mechanism	53
2.4 NEW ROUTES	57
2.5 TECHNICAL HURDLES AND PERSPECTIVES	59
2.6 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	60

2.7 REFERENCES		60
3. CO <sub>2</sub> TO ACIDS		69
3.1 INTRODUCTION		69
3.1.1 Routes and Opportunities		70
3.1.1.1 Reaction of monoenes wit	h CO <sub>2</sub>	71
3.1.1.2 Reaction of organic halide	es with CO <sub>2</sub>	74
3.1.1.3 Reaction of aromatic C(sp	<sup>2</sup> )-H with CO <sub>2</sub>	76
3.2 LOW MOLECULAR WEIGHT	ACIDS	76
3.2.1 Formic acid		76
3.2.1.1 Approaches to the synt	hesis	77
3.2.1.2 Selected recent advance	es in catalysts and reaction mechanism	78
3.2.2 Acetic acid		85
3.2.2.1 Synthesis routes from C	CO <sub>2</sub>	85
3.2.2.2 Recent advances in cata	alysts and reaction mechanism	86
3.2.3 Oxalic acid		90
3.2.3.1 Recent developments		90
3.2.4 Succinic acid		93
3.2.4.1 Recent commercial develo	ppments	94
3.3 HIGHER MOLECULAR WEIGH	HT ORGANIC ACIDS	95
3.3.1 Carboxylation and electrocar	rboxylation reactions	96
3.3.2. Aromatic carboxylic acids		102
3.3.3 Other aspects of the synthesis	s of carboxylic acids using CO <sub>2</sub>	104
3.4 TECHNICAL HURDLES AND I	PERSPECTIVES	105
4. CO <sub>2</sub> TO ESTERS		117
4.1 INTRODUCTION		117
4.1.1 Conversion routes		117
4.1.2 Potential commercial applica	ntions	118
4.1.3 Hydro and alkoxy carboxyla	tion	119
4.1.4 Direct oxidative esterificatio	n	123
4.2 METHYL FORMATE AND FOR	RMIC ESTERS	123
4.2.1 Approaches to the synthesis	and industrial relevance	124
4.2.2 Recent advances in catalysts	and reaction mechanism	126
4.3 ACRYLIC ACID AND ACRYLA	ATE ESTERS	128

4.3.1	Possible routes	128
4.3.2	Acrylic acid/esters by ethane carbonylation with CO <sub>2</sub>	129
4.3.3	Recent advances in catalysts and reaction mechanism	131
4.4 MI	ETHYL PROPIONATE AND METHYL METHACRYLATE	132
4.4.1	Approaches to the synthesis and recent advances	132
4.5 TE	CHNICAL HURDLES AND PERSPECTIVES	134
4.6 RE	FERENCES	136
5. INDI	EX	141
	FIGURES	
Figure E.1	Different paths to produce C <sub>2</sub> -C <sub>4</sub> olefins from CO <sub>2</sub> xx	vi
Figure E.2	Transformation of CO <sub>2</sub> into value-added productsxx	ix
Figure 1.1		
Figure 1.2	.1 CO <sub>2</sub> at the crossover of sustainable development of chemical and energy value chains (CO <sub>2</sub> circular economy)	4
Figure 1.3	.1 Approaches to recycling transformations of CO <sub>2</sub> as alternatives to petrochemical methods.	. 5
Figure 2.1	Raw material and technology map in the production of light olefin.  The paths in bold (black) are those mainly used today, while those in red indicate possible future routes starting from biomass, biowaste and CO <sub>2</sub> , the latter with H <sub>2</sub> generated using renewable energy sources. Paths with a dashed line and technologies indicated with a background formed by parallel lines indicate paths/technologies still under development	12
Figure 2.1	.2 Cumulative rating for the four drivers analysed to discuss the role of different routes (alternative to the use of fossil fuels) to produce olefins (from biomass, biowaste and CO <sub>2</sub> ) in relation to the future scenario for sustainable chemical production.	13
Figure 2.1	.3 Block diagram of the CO <sub>2</sub> Utilized Gas-to-Liquid Process CUGP 1	14
Figure 2.1	.4 Aspen simulation model used to evaluate CUGP process, with indication of the two options considered	15
Figure 2.1	.1.1 Different paths to produce C <sub>2</sub> -C <sub>4</sub> olefins from CO <sub>2</sub>	16
Figure 2.1	.1.2 ARPChem project structure and companies/universities involved in the main steps	17
Figure 2.1	.1.3 Technology roadmap for Japan ARPChem project	18
Figure 2.2	.1.1 Net present value of direct and two-step synthesis process of methanol from CO <sub>2</sub> .	20

Figure 2.2.1.1.1	Econamine FG PlusSM Unit with CO <sub>2</sub> Addition to the SMR Natural Gas Feed. Option 1 is preferred.	. 21
Figure 2.2.1.1.2	Schemes for CO <sub>2</sub> capture and reuse in methanol (a) and (b) urea production plants.	. 22
Figure 2.2.1.1.3	GPIC quantitative block flowsheed of the CDR plant to recover CO <sub>2</sub> from methanol plant (reformer flue gas stack) to enhance urea production	. 23
Figure 2.2.1.2.1	Specific surface rate of $CO_2$ conversion of the studied catalysts at 3.0 and 5.0 MPa (473 K) normalized to metal (MSA) and oxide surface area (OSA) (experimental conditions: T, 513 K; F, 80 stp mL/min; $CO_2/H_2/N_2 = 23/69/8$ ; $w_{cat}$ , 0.5 g).	. 25
Figure 2.2.1.2.2	Activity to methanol ( $R_{CH3OH}$ ) of catalysts studied by Fornero et al. (2013) in the synthesis of methanol using $CO_2$ -rich gas mixtures. Process conditions: $P = 3$ MPa; $T = 523$ K; $GHSV = 20,000$ h $^{-1}$ . Gray bars: Reacting mixture M1 ( $H_2/CO_2/CO = 75/22/3$ ), after 20 h on stream. White bars: Reacting mixture M2 ( $H_2/CO_2/He = 75/22/3$ ), after 4 h on stream.	. 27
Figure 2.2.1.2.3	Activity and selectivity towards methanol synthesis. a) Yield of methanol of a series of $Ni_xGa_y$ catalysts compared with $Cu/ZnO/Al_2O_3$ at atmospheric pressure. Gas composition: 75% $H_2$ and 25% $CO_2$ . Gas hourly space velocity = 6,000 h <sup>-1</sup> , b) CO-free selectivity towards methanol and DME. c) Comparison of the CO to MeOH ratio of $Cu/ZnO/Al_2O_3$ with $Ni_5Ga_3$	
Figure 2.2.2.1	Total/UOP MTO Process Integrated with Olefin Cracking Process (OCP).	. 28
Figure 2.2.2.2	Yield Benefits from OCP Integration in Total/UOP MTO Process Integrated with Olefin Cracking Process (OCP).	. 28
Figure 2.2.2.3	Comparison between SAPO-34 and HZSM-5 characteristics, in relation to MTO reaction.	. 30
Figure 2.2.2.4	Model of the active intermediate in MTO reaction present in SAPO-34 cage	. 31
Figure 2.2.2.5	(a) Effect of coke deposition on the methanol conversion and selectivity to light olefins in microscale DMTO fluidized bed reactor at 450 °C. (b) Typical Properties of the DMTO Catalyst.	. 32
Figure 2.2.2.1.1	Scheme of DMTO-II process.	. 33
Figure 2.2.2.1.2	Flowsheet of the SINOPEC S-MTO process.	. 34
Figure 2.2.2.2.1	Methanol to propylene – Lurgi MTP process.	. 35
Figure 2.2.2.2.2	Lurgi MTP process: simplified flowsheet.	. 36
Figure 2.2.2.3.1	The influence of the relative density of internal defects on catalyst deactivation for MTH reaction over HZSM-5 catalysts	. 38

Figure 2.2.2.3.2	MTO catalytic results for SAPO-34 catalysts as a function of time on steam (TOS). Reaction conditions: T = 450 °C, WHSV = 1.2 h <sup>-1</sup> , 30 wt % methanol. In the top right <sup>29</sup> Si MAS NMR spectra (top-right) of SAPO-34s. The zeolite was synthesized with TEA template (3TEA:1Al <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub> :1P <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> : xSiO <sub>2</sub> : 50H <sub>2</sub> O, 200°C, 48 h). a: x = 0.2; b: x = 0.4; = 0.6.	
Figure 2.2.2.3.3	Schematic diagram of the crystallization process of SAPO-34 with Si distribution in the crystals. The dot density in the square stands for the Si concentration in the crystals.	41
Figure 2.2.2.3.4	Catalytic performance of nano-SAPO-34	42
Figure 2.2.2.3.5	The reaction mechanism of the MTO reaction.	45
Figure 2.2.2.3.6	(a) PolyMB cycle (top) and alkene cycle (bottom) proposed for MTO over the H-MCM-22 zeolite used to unravel the catalytic roles of the supercages, pockets, and sinusoidal channels. Via the polyMB cycle, polymethylbenzenes act as the active hydrocarbon pool species, whereas via the alkene cycle, alkenes are the active hydrocarbon pool species. (b) Framework of the H-MCM-22 zeolite with three types of pores: supercages, pockets, and sinusoidal channels.	46
Figure 2.2.2.3.7	Olefin-based catalytic cycle proposed to be the primary reaction pathway during the early stages of the MTO reaction over H-SAPO-34	47
Figure 2.2.2.3.8	Methanol conversion and selectivity to light olefins with time-on-stream over nano SAPO catalysts. In the inset, SEM image of the most stable S3 sample. Experimental conditions: WHSV = 2 h <sup>-1</sup> , T = 400°C, catalyst weight =300 mg.	48
Figure 2.2.2.4.1	Schematic flowsheet of DTP process (JGC - Mitsubishi Chem.).	51
Figure 2.2.2.4.2	Schematic representation of the difference between using methanol or DME in olefin formation on SAPO-34.	52
Figure 2.3.2.1	Comparison of product selectivities in promoted and unpromoted iron- based catalysts for FTO reaction.	55
Figure 2.3.2.2	Manganese-modified Fe <sub>3</sub> O <sub>4</sub> microsphere catalyst with effective active phase of forming light olefins from syngas.	57
Figure 3.1.1	Formation of carboxylic acids, cyclic carbonates, and polycarbonates using CO <sub>2</sub> as reagent. Source: Martìn and Kleij (2011)	69
Figure 3.1.2	Kolbe–Schmitt synthesis starting from resorcinol with a CO <sub>2</sub> -precursor giving 2,4-DHBA (target product) and 2,6-DHBA as byproduct	70
Figure 3.1.1.1.1	Reaction scheme with formation of the five-membered metallactone in the conversion of ethylene and CO <sub>2</sub> to acrylic acid.	71
Figure 3.1.1.1.2	FeCl <sub>2</sub> -catalyzed hydrocarboxylation of aromatic alkenes with CO <sub>2</sub>	72
Figure 3.1.1.1.3	Carboxylation of ethene with CO <sub>2</sub> promoted by esterification	72

Figure 3.1.1.1.4	The catalytic carboxylation of ethane with CO <sub>2</sub> .	73
Figure 3.1.1.1.5	Transition metal-free synthesis of 3-carboxylated indoles from 2-ethynylanilines.	74
Figure 3.1.1.2.1	NiCl <sub>2</sub> -catalyzed carboxylation of aryl/vinyl chlorides.	75
Figure 3.1.1.2.2	Ni-catalyzed carboxylation of benzyl chlorides/bromides with CO <sub>2</sub>	75
Figure 3.1.1.3.1	Al <sub>2</sub> Cl <sub>6</sub> /Al-mediated carboxylation of activated arenes.	76
Figure 3.2.1.2.1	<ul> <li>(a) Parallel catalytic cycle in CO<sub>2</sub> hydrogenation by (PNP)IrH<sub>3</sub>.</li> <li>(b) active <i>trans</i>-Ir<sup>III</sup>(dihydride) and dormant <i>fac</i>-Ir<sup>III</sup>(trihydride) species in the hydrogenation of CO<sub>2</sub> to formic acid.</li> </ul>	79
Figure 3.2.1.2.2	System proposed for the highly efficient dissociation of H <sub>2</sub> O for the reduction of CO <sub>2</sub> to formic acid with Mn.	80
Figure 3.2.1.2.3	A novel graphene-based visible light active photocatalyst which covalently bonded the chromophore (multianthraquinone substituted porphyrin) for an efficient photosynthetic production of formic acid from CO <sub>2</sub> .	81
Figure 3.2.1.2.4	Hybrid material consisting of Ag/CaTaO <sub>2</sub> N (a perovskite oxynitride semiconductor having a band gap of 2.5 eV, to which Ag nanoparticles were deposited) and a binuclear Ru(II) complex to produce photocatalytically HCOOH via CO <sub>2</sub> reduction.	82
Figure 3.2.1.2.5	Application of ionic liquids to promote the electrocatalytic reduction of CO <sub>2</sub> to formic acid.	83
Figure 3.2.1.2.6	Electrochemical Reduction of Carbon Dioxide in an MFC–MEC System with a Layer-by-Layer Self-Assembly Carbon Nanotube/Cobalt Phthalocyanine Modified Electrode.	83
Figure 3.2.1.2.7	Scaling relation between the binding energy of the catalyst to H and to COOH, a key intermediate in the reduction of CO <sub>2</sub> to CO. This scaling relation holds even with axial ligation to the metal cation coordinated to the porphyrin ring.	84
Figure 3.2.1.2.8	Importance of embedding covalency into metal catalysts for efficient electrochemical conversion of CO <sub>2</sub> .	85
Figure 3.2.2.2.1	Conversion of CO <sub>2</sub> and CH <sub>4</sub> to acetic acid over Au-exchanged ZSM-5	87
Figure 3.2.2.2.2	Scheme of the apparatus of microbial electrosynthesis of acetic acid from carbon dioxide, with indications on the high productivity	88
Figure 3.2.2.2.3	Cell design for the integrated production, extraction and concentration of acetic acid from CO <sub>2</sub> through microbial electrosynthesis (MES)	88
Figure 3.2.2.4	Approach used to store renewable energy in the form of chemical energy, based on the microbial electrosynthesis of acetate from CO <sub>2</sub>	89
Figure 3.2.3.1.1	Proposed electrocatalytic cycle for Li-oxalate formation by CO <sub>2</sub> capture	91

Figure 3.2.3.1.2	Three-step reaction cycle for reduction of carbon dioxide to oxalic acid. The starting copper(II) complexes (1 and 2) are reduced to Cu(I) complex 3 in the presence of sodium ascorbate. Complex 3 reacts with CO <sub>2</sub> to give oxalate-bridged complex 4. The oxalate is released in the form of oxalic acid in the presence of acids.	92
Figure 3.2.3.1.3	Paths in electro- and photochemical CO <sub>2</sub> reduction in aqueous solutions depending on the type of metal-complexes.	93
Figure 3.2.4.1.1	Reduction of greenhouse gas emissions in the production of biosuccinic acid reduces with respect to petroleum-derived succinic acid and to petroleum-derived adipic acid.	95
Figure 3.3.1.1	Metal-promoted carboxylation of alkynes/allenes with carbon dioxide	96
Figure 3.3.1.2	One-pot synthesis of ethyl (Z)-3-(benzylamino)-3-phenylacrylate from phenylacetylene, benzylamine and CO <sub>2</sub> .	97
Figure 3.3.1.3	Synthesis of salicylic acid and p-hydroxybenzoic acid via Kolbe–Schmidt reaction.	
Figure 3.3.1.4	Electrochemical fixation of CO <sub>2</sub> and renewable energy in olefins	99
Figure 3.3.1.5	Electrocarboxylations of dienes with CO <sub>2</sub> .	100
Figure 3.3.1.6	General mechanism for electrocarboxylation of alkynes.	101
Figure 3.3.1.7	Electrocarboxylation of AMN to HN using a sacrificial aluminum anode	101
Figure 3.3.1.8	Convergent paired electrosynthesis of cyanoacetic acid, with $X^- = F_4B^-$ , $ClO_4^-$ , $HSO_4^-$ , $Cl^-$ , $Br^-$	102
Figure 3.3.2.1	Chemoselective carboxylation with CO <sub>2</sub> to give arylcarboxylic acids and arylacetic acids.	103
Figure 3.3.2.2	Copper-catalyzed oxidative dehydrogenative carboxylation (ODC) of unactivated alkanes with various substituted benzoic acids to produce the corresponding allylic esters.	104
Figure 3.3.3.1	The catalytic conversion of C-H bonds into carboxylic acids using CO <sub>2</sub> as the sole source of carbon	104
Figure 3.3.3.2	Direct carboxylation of arenes via chelation assistance	105
Figure 4.1.1	Transformation of CO <sub>2</sub> into value-added products.	117
Figure 4.1.2	Insertion of CO <sub>2</sub> into a M-C bond.	118
Figure 4.1.3.1	Hydrocarboxylation of 1,3-dienes to yield the $\beta$ , $\gamma$ -unsaturated carboxylic acid.	120
Figure 4.1.3.2	Highly efficient gold(i)-catalyzed regio- and stereoselective hydrocarboxylation of internal alkynes, under solvent- and silver-free conditions.	121
Figure 4.1.3.3	Silver-catalyzed trans addition of carboxylic acids to ynol ethers	121
Figure 4.1.3.4	Palladium-catalyzed hydrocarboxylation of alkynes with formic acid	122

Figure 4.1.3.5	Catalytic protocol for the synthesis of carboxylic acids directly from CO <sub>2</sub> , H <sub>2</sub> , and simple olefins (hydrocarboxylation).	
Figure 4.2.1	Indirect (practical) routes of CO <sub>2</sub> -to-methanol conversion	124
Figure 4.2.1.1	Process scheme proposed by BASF for preparing formic esters from carbo dioxide, hydrogen and an alcohol. I-2 hydrogenation reactor; II-2 distillation unit; 11 stream comprising carbon dioxide; 12 stream comprising hydroge 13 stream comprising alcohol (Ib); 14 stream comprising formic ester (Ia1 water of reaction, unreacted alcohol (Ib); worked up hydrogenation mixtur (Hw); 15 stream comprising formic ester (Ia2); target product; first stream 16 stream comprising water of reaction; third stream; 17 stream comprising unreacted amine (Ic), second stream.	on n; ), re ;
Figure 4.2.2.1	Hydrogenation of carbon dioxide to formate catalyzed by Ru pincer complexes.	126
Figure 4.2.2.2	Homogeneous hydrogenation of CO <sub>2</sub> to methyl formate utilizing switchable ionic liquids (ILs).	126
Figure 4.2.2.3	Alkyl formate as step in a cascade reaction to produce methanol from CO <sub>2</sub> .	127
Figure 4.3.1.1	Emerging novel routes to acrylic acid using CO <sub>2</sub> directly or indirectly	128
Figure 4.3.2.1	Formation of nickel-lactones and subsequent protonation.	129
Figure 4.3.2.2	(a) The hypothetic coupling of ethene and CO <sub>2</sub> . (b) The first catalytic cycle for the formation of sodium acrylate proposed by BASF researchers.	129
Figure 4.3.2.3	Catalytic reaction cycle (two steps) developed by BASF for the synthesis of pure Na-acrylate from ethylene and CO <sub>2</sub> , with selected key results and a process scheme.	130
Figure 4.4.1.1	Catalytic hydroxycarbonylation of olefins.	132
Figure 4.4.1.2	Conversion of CO <sub>2</sub> and C <sub>2</sub> H <sub>6</sub> to propanoic acid on an iridium-modified graphene oxide surface.	133
Figure 4.4.1.3	Conversion of CO <sub>2</sub> and C <sub>2</sub> H <sub>6</sub> to propanoic acid over a au-exchanged MCM-22 zeolite.	134
	TABLES	
Table 2.2.2.1	Selectivity and Yield to Light Olefins in MTO Reaction Using SAPO-34	29
Table 2.2.2.2	SAPO-34 vs. SSZ-13 Performances in MTO Reaction	. 30
Table 2.2.2.1.1	Average Results of DMTO-II Demonstration Unit	
Table 2.2.2.3.1	MTO Reaction Results over SAPO-34 Synthesized with and without HF <sup>a</sup>	. 42

Table 2.2.2.3.2	(top): Lifetime <sup>a</sup> and Product Distribution <sup>b</sup> of SAPO-34s in the MTO Reaction (WHSV = 3 h <sup>-1</sup> , T = 450°C). (middle): SEM Images of Calcined Samples 6 (left), 7 (middle) and 8 (right). (bottom): Synthesis Conditions, <sup>a</sup> Yields and Composition of Products	43
Table 2.3.2.1	Catalytic Performance at 20 Bar in Syngas to Light Olefin on Iron-based Catalysts; Catalytic Tests were Performed at 340°C and a H <sub>2</sub> /CO Ratio of 1; Results after 64 Hours on Stream are Shown	54
Table 2.4.1	Current Efficiencies for the Products Obtained in the Electrochemical Reduction of CO <sub>2</sub> on a Copper(I) Halide-confined Cu-mesh Electrode	58
Table 4.2.1.1	Selected Examples Showing How Formic Esters Can Be Obtained Easily by Hydrogenation Of CO <sub>2</sub> Using the Gold Catalysts	. 125