

GOING TO ZERO SULFUR II

A technical investigation
commissioned by the members of the
Catalytic Advances Program (CAP)

Client Private
November 2012



The Catalytic Advances Program (CAP)

The Catalytic Advances Program (CAP) is an information resource for research and development organizations in the petroleum, chemical, and polymer industries. By the direction of the member companies (through balloting and other interactive means), the program delivers a range of timely and insightful information and analyses which are accessible exclusively to members and protected by confidentiality agreements. The objective is to provide a technical update on commercially viable advances in catalysis as well as benchmark commercial advances in catalysis and process technology.

Members receive three in-depth **CAP Technical Reports** which are written and peer reviewed by leading scientists and experienced industry professionals in areas selected by the membership (via ballot); weekly *CAP Communications* (delivered via e-mail) which provide the latest updates on technical breakthroughs, commercial events and exclusive development opportunities; and attendance at the **CAP Annual Meeting**.

The **Catalytic Advances Program (CAP)** is available on a membership basis from The Catalyst Group Resources (TCGR). For further details, please contact Matthew A. Colquitt at Matthew.A.Colquitt@catalystgrp.com or +1.215.628.4447 (x1130).



P.O. Box 680
Spring House, PA 19477 U.S.A
ph: +1.215.628.4447
fax: +1.215.628.2267
website: www.catalystgrp.com

CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	xxxiii
1. INTRODUCTION	1
2. SULFUR IN TRANSPORTATION FUELS: TODAY AND IN THE FUTURE	5
2.1 INTRODUCTION.....	5
2.2 SULFUR CONTROL REGULATIONS AND STANDARDS	6
2.2.1 Elements of Sulfur Control Regulations	6
2.2.2 Trans-National Guidelines for Sulfur Standards	7
2.2.2.1 The Euro Standards	8
2.2.2.2 The Worldwide Fuel Charter.....	9
2.2.3 Additional Comments on Sulfur Standards.....	9
2.3 CURRENT FUEL SULFUR STANDARDS	9
2.3.1 Current Gasoline Sulfur Standards.....	9
2.3.1.1 United States, ex California.....	10
2.3.1.2 California.....	11
2.3.1.3 European Union.....	11
2.3.1.4 China	12
2.3.1.5 Mexico.....	12
2.3.1.6 Brazil	12
2.3.2 Current Diesel Fuel Sulfur Standards.....	12
2.3.2.1 United States, ex California.....	13
2.3.2.2 California.....	14
2.3.2.3 European Union.....	14
2.3.2.4 China	14
2.3.2.5 Mexico.....	15
2.3.2.6 Brazil	15
2.3.3 Off-Road Diesel Fuel	16
2.3.4 New Marine Diesel Fuel Standards: Marpol Annex VI	16
2.3.4.1 Background	16
2.3.4.2 Emission Control Areas (ECAs)	17
2.3.4.3 Annex VI Fuel Sulfur Standard.....	17

2.3.4.4	Prospective Compliance Routes	18
2.3.5	Sulfur Standards Apply to Finished, In-Use Fuels	18
2.4	COMMERCIAL STATUS OF DESULFURIZATION PROCESSES COVERED IN <i>GOING TO ZERO SULFUR: CHALLENGES AND PROGRESS</i>	19
2.4.1	Introduction: Desulfurization Then and Now	19
2.4.1.1	Then (2003).	19
2.4.1.2	Now (2012)	20
2.4.2	Gasoline Desulfurization	20
2.4.3	Diesel Fuel Desulfurization	22
2.4.4	Marine Diesel Fuel	25
2.4.5	Additional Comments	25
2.4.5.1	Limited Prospects for Novel Desulfurization Technologies	25
2.4.5.2	FCC Feed Hydrotreating	26
2.4.5.3	Observations on the Refining Economics of ULSG and ULSD Production	26
2.5	REFERENCES	29
3.	ADVANCES IN SULFUR REMOVAL TECHNOLOGY	31
3.1	INTRODUCTION	31
3.1.1	Current Sulfur Removal Challenges	31
3.1.1.1	Going to 10 ppm and Below	31
3.1.1.2	LCO Conversion of Diesel	32
3.2	R&D ADVANCES SINCE <i>GOING TO ZERO: CHALLENGES AND PROGRESS</i>	32
3.2.1	Basic Understanding of the Transition Metal Sulfide (TMS) Catalytic Materials	32
3.2.1.1	Preparation of Transition-Metal Sulfides	34
3.2.1.1.1	Binary Sulfides	35
3.2.1.1.2	Mixed-Metal Sulfides	36
3.2.1.1.3	Ternary Sulfides	37
3.2.1.2	TMS Structure and the Promotion Effect	39
3.2.1.3	Structure and Properties of TMS Catalytic Materials	42
3.2.1.4	Structure/Function Relationships	45
3.2.1.5	Surface Composition and Importance of Pretreatment	55
3.2.1.6	Theoretical Studies	60
3.2.1.7	Hydrodesulfurization Mechanisms	61
3.2.1.8	Conclusion TMS Catalytic Materials	63
3.3	BIOLOGICAL DESULFURIZATION	64

3.3.1	Lessons from the Valdez Oil Spill	64
3.3.2	Commercial Attempts of Biological Desulfurization	65
3.3.3	The Future of Biological Desulfurization	66
3.4	OXIDATIVE DESULFURIZATION	66
3.4.1	The Future of Oxidative Desulfurization	67
3.5	OTHER SULFUR REMOVAL PROCESSES	67
3.5.1	Absorption	67
3.5.2	Distillation	68
3.5.3	Membrane Separation	69
3.5.4	Alkali Metal Desulfurization	69
3.5.5	Desulfurization using Elemental Sodium	70
3.6	FUTURE R&D DIRECTIONS	71
3.7	REFERENCES	73
	INDEX	83

FIGURES

Figure 3.1	Unsupported catalyst achieve stable state in reactor	34
Figure 3.2	Monolayer Model of Schuit and Gates	40
Figure 3.3	Pseudointercalation model of Voorhoeve and Stuiver and Farragher and Cossee	41
Figure 3.4	Periodic trends for HDS	46
Figure 3.5	Correlation between heat of formation of sulfides and heat of adsorption of sulfur on transition metals	47
Figure 3.6	In this model of the reaction, the desulfurization of an organic molecule was considered equivalent to the sulfurization of the metal used as a catalyst	48
Figure 3.7	Calculated vs. experimental trends for the synergic pairs	49
Figure 3.8	The Tanaka experiment cutting a MoS ₂ crystal along the c axis increases its hydrogenation activity	50
Figure 3.9	The rim/edge model	51
Figure 3.10	Reaction pathway for the HDS of DBT	52
Figure 3.11	The different S and Mo coordination number sites of a hexagonal MoS ₂ crystallite	53
Figure 3.12	Carbon stripping and replacing sulfur on the surface of a RuS ₂ particle stabilized in a catalytic environment	54
Figure 3.13	NEXAFS spectra at the C K-edge of an unsupported MoS ₂ sample treated under dibenzothiophene HDS conditions and a β -Mo ₂ C	55

Figure 3.14	This result started an entire trend toward bio-desulfurization, discussed in the next section	65
Figure 3.15	In this case, the organisms would desulfurize the crude oils at the production site as the process was completed and then the product would go into the pipeline. This approach requires enough tanks so that the pipeline is continuously filled.....	66
Figure 3.16	Sulfur removal after the catalytic distillation	68
Figure 3.17	The relative desulfurization of two synthetic feeds using thiophene as a model compound	69
Figure 3.18	TransFinishing-R Process.....	70
Figure 3.19	TransFinishing-R Installation.....	71
Figure 3.20	High surface area MoS ₂ catalysts.....	72
Figure 3.21	High surface area MoS ₂ catalyst pore structure	73

TABLES

Table 1	Summary of advances in hydroprocessing with sulfides since 2003	xv
Table 2	Summary of process improvements, new processes and catalyst developments	xviii
Table ES.1	Gasoline and diesel sulfur standards.....	xxxiv
Table ES.2	Advanced gasoline desulfurization processes in widest use.....	xxxv
Table ES.3	Diesel desulfurization processes and catalysts now in widest use	xxxv
Table ES.4	MARPOL Annex VI sulfur standards	xxxvi
Table 2.1	Euro sulfur standards gasoline and diesel fuel	8
Table 2.2	Worldwide fuel charter sulfur recommendations gasoline and diesel fuel.....	9
Table 2.3	Gasoline sulfur standards.....	10
Table 2.4	Diesel fuel sulfur standards (ppm).....	13
Table 2.5	Marpol Annex VI sulfur standards	17
Table 2.6	Gasoline desulfurization processes covered in the 2003 report.....	21
Table 2.7	Advanced gasoline desulfurization processes in widest use.....	22
Table 2.8	Diesel desulfurization processes and catalysts covered in <i>Going to Zero Sulfur: Challenges and Progress</i>	23
Table 2.9	Diesel desulfurization processes and catalysts now in widest use	24
Table 2.10	Estimated average refining cost of producing 10 ppm sulfur gasoline and diesel fuel in Brazil, China, India, and Mexico	28