

PROGRESS TOWARDS COST-EFFECTIVE AND SUSTAINABLE H₂ PRODUCTION

A techno-economic investigation
commissioned by the members of the
Carbon Dioxide Capture & Conversion (CO₂CC) Program

Client Private
November 2017



The Carbon Dioxide Capture & Conversion (CO₂CC) Program

The **CO₂CC Program** is a membership-directed consortium whose members are involved in the development, monitoring and utilization of the “state-of-the-art” in technological progress and commercial implementation of carbon dioxide capture/clean-up and conversion. By the direction of the member companies (through balloting and other interactive means), the program delivers a range of timely and insightful information and analyses which are accessible exclusively to members and protected by confidentiality agreements. The objective is to document technically and commercially viable options for CO₂ capture/clean-up as well as its conversion into useful products which meaningfully address the challenges posed by CO₂ life-cycle and overall sustainability issues.

Members receive three in-depth **CO₂CC Techno-economic Reports** which are written by leading scientists and experienced industry professionals in areas selected by the membership (via ballot); weekly *CO₂CC Communiqués* (delivered via e-mail) which provide the latest updates on technical breakthroughs, commercial events and exclusive development opportunities; and attendance at the CO₂CC Program **Annual Meeting**.

The **Carbon Dioxide Capture & Conversion (CO₂CC) Program** is available on a membership basis from The Catalyst Group Resources (TCGR). For further details, please contact John J. Murphy at John.J.Murphy@catalystgrp.com or +1.215.628.4447 (x1121).



P.O. Box 680
Spring House, PA 19477 U.S.A
ph: +1.215.628.4447

CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.....	xxiii
1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 BACKGROUND	1
1.2 SCOPE AND OBJECTIVES	1
1.3 ACTIVATION OF CO ₂ FOR METHANOL PRODUCTION	3
1.4 ACTIVATION OF CO ₂ FOR OTHER PRODUCTS	5
1.5 FUEL CELL APPLICATIONS	7
1.6 REPORT CONTRIBUTORS.....	10
1.7 REFERENCES.....	12
2. REVIEW OF THERMAL TECHNOLOGIES FOR HYDROGEN PRODUCTION	15
2.1 FUEL PROCESSING TECHNOLOGIES.....	17
2.1.1 Introduction.....	17
2.2 OVERVIEW OF FUEL PROCESSING TECHNOLOGIES	17
2.2.1 Natural gas	17
2.2.2 Coal	25
2.2.3 Ammonia.....	28
2.2.4 Glycerol reforming.....	29
2.3 ECONOMICS OF HYDROGEN PRODUCTION FROM FUEL PROCESSING	29
2.4 TECHNO-ECONOMIC HURDLES IN FUEL PROCESSING.....	30
2.5 RECENT ADVANCES IN FUEL PROCESSING TECHNOLOGIES	32
2.5.1 Coke-resistant materials.....	32
2.5.2 Sulfur-resistant materials	33
2.5.3 Membrane reforming	33
2.5.4 Fluidized bed membrane reforming.....	33
2.5.5 Methane tri-reforming.....	35
2.5.6 Ammonia decomposition	36
2.5.7 Photo-induced reforming	37
2.6 SUMMARY	38
2.7 REFERENCES.....	39
3. REVIEW OF EXISTING H₂ SEPARATION TECHNOLOGIES.....	49

3.1	ADSORPTION TECHNOLOGIES.....	49
3.1.1	A brief introduction/review of H ₂ PSA technology	49
3.1.1.1	The PSA process	50
3.1.1.2	Sorbents.....	54
3.1.1.3	H ₂ PSA & SMR.....	55
3.1.2	Major offerers of the technology.....	56
3.1.2.1	Honeywell UOP	56
3.1.2.2	Linde	57
3.1.2.3	Air Products	57
3.1.3	Mechanical issues / reliability.....	58
3.1.4	Recent advances in technology	59
3.1.4.1	Fast cycles	59
3.1.4.2	Structured sorbents.....	59
3.1.4.3	Rotary valves (Questor / Xebec).....	59
3.1.4.5	GEMINI Dual Product Systems.....	60
3.1.4.5	Air Products Sour PSA	60
3.1.4.6	Sorption enhanced reaction systems	61
3.2	ABSORPTION TECHNOLGIES	62
3.2.1	Technology review.....	62
3.2.2	Solvents	64
3.3	MEMBRANE TECHNOLGIES	66
3.3.1	Technology review.....	66
3.3.2	Major players	70
3.3.2.1	Air Products PRISM® membranes.....	70
3.3.2.2	Air Liquide ALaS/MEDAL™ membranes	71
3.3.2.3	UBE.....	72
3.3.2.4	Honeywell UOP	72
3.3.2.5	MTR (Membrane Technology & Research)	72
3.3.3	Integrations with other separations	73
3.3.4	Relative capital & energy consumption	73
3.4	References	76

4. ADVANCES IN TECHNOLOGY FOR COST-EFFECTIVE AND SUSTAINABLE H₂ PRODUCTION	79
4.1 THERMOCHEMICAL WATER SPLITTING TECHNOLOGIES	79
4.1.1 Introduction	79
4.1.2 Multi-step water splitting for hydrogen production	81
4.1.1.1 S-I cycle	81
4.1.2.2 Economics of nuclear hydrogen production	84
4.1.3 Two-step thermochemical cycles for water splitting	85
4.1.3.1 General description and up-to-date achieved efficiency	85
4.1.3.2 Solar reactors for water splitting in TSTCs	87
4.1.3.3 ZnO/Zn cycle	87
4.1.3.4 Fe ₃ O ₄ /FeO cycle.....	89
4.1.3.5 Thermochemical cycles based on ceria.....	92
4.1.3.6 Economics of solar hydrogen production	94
4.1.3.7 Techno-economic hurdles in water splitting.....	95
4.1.4 Recent advances in thermochemical water splitting technologies.....	97
4.1.4.1 Nuclear hydrogen production.....	97
4.1.4.2 Solar hydrogen production.....	97
4.1.5 Summary	99
4.2 PHOTOCHEMICAL WATER SPLITTING.....	99
4.2.1 Introduction.....	99
4.2.2 Evaluation of Photocatalytic H ₂ O splitting systems	101
4.2.3 H ₂ O splitting employing UV photocatalysts.....	102
4.2.3.1 TiO ₂ and Titanates for H ₂ O splitting.....	102
4.2.3.2 Nb- and Ta-, W-, and Mo-based oxides for H ₂ O splitting.....	103
4.2.3.3 d ¹⁰ and f ⁰ metal oxide for H ₂ O splitting	103
4.2.4. H ₂ O Splitting employing visible light-driven photocatalysts	104
4.2.4.1 Z-scheme photocatalysts	104
4.2.4.2. Metal sulfides.....	109
4.2.4.3 GaN:ZnO solid solution photocatalysts	109
4.2.4.4 Dye-sensitized solar cells to harvest visible light for H ₂ O splitting	110
4.2.5 Co-catalysts for efficient H ₂ O splitting.....	112

4.2.6	Future improvements	114
4.3	WATER ELECTROLYSIS	115
4.3.1	Introduction.....	115
4.3.2	Benchmarking	116
4.3.2.1	Technical description	116
4.3.2.1.1	Fundamentals of water electrolysis.....	116
4.3.2.1.2	Alkaline electrolyzers.....	119
4.3.2.1.3	Polymer Exchange Membrane (PEM) electrolyzers.....	122
4.3.2.1.4	Solid Oxide Electrolyzers	124
4.3.2.1.5	Electrocatalysis	125
4.3.2.2	Performance assessment	127
4.3.2.2.1	Comparison of technologies.....	127
4.3.2.2.2	Strategies for energy storage.....	128
4.3.2.3	Economics.....	134
4.3.2.4	Environmental impact	137
4.3.3	Recent advances.....	140
4.3.4	Future improvements	142
4.4	BIOMASS PROCESSING	146
4.4.1	Biofuels	146
4.4.2	Supercritical water gasification of coal and/or biomass	149
4.4.3	Ethanol reforming	150
4.5	CHEMICAL LOOPING TECHNOLOGIES.....	152
4.5.1	Introduction.....	152
4.5.1.1	Concept	152
4.5.1.2	Technical advantages and applications of chemical looping	153
4.5.2	Chemical looping for hydrogen production	154
4.5.2.1	Chemical looping hydrogen (CLH)	154
4.5.2.2	Chemical looping reforming (CLR).....	158
4.5.2.3	Chemical looping dry reforming of methane (CLDRM).....	160
4.5.3	Techno-economic hurdles in chemical looping	161
4.5.3.1	Choice of oxygen carrier.....	161
4.5.3.2	Sintering and agglomeration	164

4.5.3.3	Coke and sulfide formation.....	164
4.5.4	Recent advances in chemical looping technologies.....	165
4.5.4.1	Calcium looping process (CLP).....	165
4.5.4.2	Cheaper materials.....	168
4.5.5	Summary.....	168
4.6	REFERENCES.....	170
5.	INDEX.....	201

FIGURES

Figure ES-1	US DOE Hydrogen Production Pathways and Production Scale.....	xxiii
Figure ES-2	Cost vs. Global Warming Potential (GWP) for Select Technologies.....	xxv
Figure 1.2.1	DOE Quadrennial Technology Review 2015 – Hydrogen Value as a Clean Energy Carrier.....	2
Figure 1.3.1	MCI’s schematic of chemical immobilization of CO ₂	4
Figure 1.4.1	Covestro polyol containing CO ₂	7
Figure 1.5.1	Fuel Cell types and schematics	10
Figure 2.1	H ₂ production from solid, liquid, and gas fuels	16
Figure 2.2	Renewable energy options for hydrogen production through thermal, electrical, biochemical or photo driven hydrogen.....	16
Figure 2.1.1	Feedstock used in H ₂ production	17
Figure 2.2.1	Diagram of SMR.....	18
Figure 2.2.2	Simplified flowsheet of a steam methane reforming plant for hydrogen production	18
Figure 2.2.3	Exergy flows and un-used exergy breakdown for steam methane reforming..	20
Figure 2.2.4	Exergy flow diagram of conventional H ₂ production system.....	21
Figure 2.2.5	Comparison of the conventional monolith vs. Microlith®	22
Figure 2.2.6	Process diagram of the thermocatalytic decomposition of methane with metal catalysts	24
Figure 2.2.7	Hydrogen cost from autocatalytic decomposition of methane (AD) as a function of Carbon Selling Price (SR: Steam Reforming, CCS: Carbon Capture and Storage, LC: Low conversion, HC: High conversion)	25
Figure 2.2.8	Schematic of the coal gasification process.....	26
Figure 2.2.9	Exergetic overview of all investigated cases	27
Figure 2.2.10	Schematic representation: (a) FBMR; (b) MSFBMR.....	28

Figure 2.4.1	Exergy efficiency of hydrogen production from biomass as a function of moisture content.....	31
Figure 2.5.1	A fluidized bed membrane reactor for H ₂ production.....	34
Figure 2.5.2	Industrial test plant, built by built by Tecnimont-KT in Chieti (Italy)	35
Figure 2.5.3	Enhanced adsorption and reaction in a microcapsular-like reactor	37
Figure 3.1.1	Simplified H ₂ PSA Process Illustration.....	51
Figure 3.1.2	Basic H ₂ PSA Process	52
Figure 3.1.3	Photograph of an H ₂ PSA System in an SMR- H ₂ Plant.....	53
Figure 3.1.4	Impact of H ₂ PSA Purge Pressure on Recovery.....	55
Figure 3.2.1	Block Flow Schematic of CO ₂ Removal via Solvent Wash	63
Figure 4.1.1	Schematic of the Sulfur-Iodine cycle.....	81
Figure 4.1.2	Sulfur-iodine cycle process flow diagram.....	82
Figure 4.1.3	Various options for treating the HI _x mixture in the HI section	83
Figure 4.1.4	Thermal-to-hydrogen efficiency and the thermal energy required to produce 1 kg of hydrogen	83
Figure 4.1.5	Solar reactors for the decomposition of sulphuric acid in the S-I cycle.....	84
Figure 4.1.6	Hydrogen production cost breakdown. Left panel: 1 st of a kind; right panel: N th of a kind.....	84
Figure 4.1.7	Mass balance for ZnO/Zn cycle	88
Figure 4.1.8	Schematic of the solar reactor used for ZnO reduction. (Shunk, 2009). 1 : roasting cavity, 2: Alumina-silica insulation, 3: Alumina – yttrium insulation 4: Alumina fibers, 5:reactor shell, 6: aperture, 7: window (quartz), 8: dynamic feeder, 9: conical en.....	89
Figure 4.1.9	Mass balance for Fe ₃ O ₄ /FeO cycle	89
Figure 4.1.10	Schematic of ideal Fe ₃ O ₄ /FeO cycle operating between 450 K and 2500 K...	90
Figure 4.1.11	Schematic of the CR5 reactor	91
Figure 4.1.12	Inha University’s 5 kW _t dish concentrator in Korea.....	91
Figure 4.1.13	Solar reactor used for the ceria redox cycle.....	93
Figure 4.1.14	Equilibrium composition of a initial mixture of CO ₂ , H ₂ O, and Ce ₂ O ₃	93
Figure 4.1.15	HyS 100kW demonstration facility.....	98
Figure 4.2.1	Schematic representation of a photoelectrochemical cell (PEC).	102
Figure 4.2.2	Schematic energy diagrams of photocatalytic water splitting systems: (a) two-step photoexcitation system and (b) conventional one-step system..	105
Figure 4.2.3	Overview of water splitting on Z-scheme photocatalysis system with an iodate (IO ₃ ⁻) and iodide (I ⁻) ion redox couple	106

Figure 4.2.4	Schematic illustration of spontaneous H ₂ and O ₂ evolution by Ru/Na,V-STO and Ru/Rh-STO under irradiation with visible light in the presence of IO ₃ ⁻ /I ⁻ redox mediator	106
Figure 4.2.5	Comparison of the photocatalytic hydrogen evolution rate in different samples over 5 h [25 mL of an aqueous solution containing 0.35 M Na ₂ S and 0.25 M Na ₂ SO ₃ , 10 mg of catalysts, simulated-light irradiation (xenon lamp, 225 W)]	107
Figure 4.2.6	Schematics of the asymmetric nanoscale tree-like heterostructures used for solar-driven water splitting.	108
Figure 4.2.7	Basic principle of dye-sensitized photocatalytic H ₂ production from water..	110
Figure 4.2.8	(top) Schematic diagram of a water-splitting dye sensitized solar cell. The inset illustrates a sensitizer-capped IrO ₂ ·nH ₂ O catalyst particle in the mesopores of the TiO ₂ electrode film. (bottom left) Current transient obtained upon visible light illumination. (bottom right) Energy level diagram showing the rates of forward and back electron transfer from and to the sensitizer molecule	111
Figure 4.2.9	Schematic illustration of a molecular device employing a photoanode co-adsorbed with a photosensitizer [Ru(bpy) ₂ (4,4-(PO ₃ H ₂) ₂ bpy)]Br ₂ (1) and a molecular Ru catalyst (2) on nanostructured TiO ₂ (TiO ₂ (1+2)), and a passive Pt cathode, for visible light driven water splitting in aqueous solution	112
Figure 4.2.10	Schematic illustration of H ₂ evolution on core/shell-structured nanoparticles (with a noble metal or metal oxide core and a Cr ₂ O ₃ shell) as a cocatalyst for photocatalytic overall H ₂ O splitting	113
Figure 4.3.1	Integration of water electrolysis in Power-to-Power and Power-to-Gas applications	116
Figure 4.3.2	Schematic representation of a water electrolysis cell. Compartments for cathode and anode are separated by a diaphragm to facilitate gas separation.	119
Figure 4.3.3	Configuration of electrolysis (a) monopolar module with parallel connection of cells, and (b) bipolar module with series connection of cells .	120
Figure 4.3.4	Industrial alkaline electrolyzer at Azko Nobel ©NEL (H ₂ -international).....	122
Figure 4.3.5	Scheme of the operating principle of a Proton Exchange Membrane (PEM) electrolyzer	123
Figure 4.3.6	PEM commercial installation (ProtonOnSite, M-Series).....	124
Figure 4.3.7	Scheme of the operating principle of a Solid Oxide Electrolysis (SOE)	125
Figure 4.3.8	Specific energy demand of electrolysis systems at different production rates	127
Figure 4.3.9	Main components of hydrogen Power-to-Gas and Power-to-Power systems	130

Figure 4.3.10	Hydrogen cost, \$ ₂₀₀₅ /kg, for several production scenarios using alkaline electrolyzers	134
Figure 4.3.11	Indicative costs breakdown for commercial Alkaline and PEM electrolysis systems.....	136
Figure 4.3.12	Schematic representation of a common cradle-to-gate approach for hydrogen production by water electrolysis in LCA studies. Only main flows are represented.....	137
Figure 4.3.13	Global warming potential of hydrogen produced by electrolysis and other reference technologies.....	139
Figure 4.3.14	Global warming potential, in grams per MJ of LHV _{fuel} , of hydrogen and methane from Power-to-Gas approaches	140
Figure 4.3.15	Cell voltage vs. Current Density for electrolysis technologies (AEL: alkaline water electrolysis; PEMEL: proton exchange membrane electrolysis; HTEL: high temperature electrolysis)	144
Figure 4.4.1	Schematic of bio-oil reforming	147
Figure 4.4.2	Scheme of system for H ₂ production from coal in supercritical water with a fluidized bed reactor: 1 feedstock tank; 2,3 feeder; 4 fluidization bed reactor; 5 heat exchanger; 6 pre-heater; 7 cooler; 8,9,10 back-pressure regulator; 11 high pressure separator; 12 low pressure separator; 13,14 wet test meter; 15,16,17,18 high pressure metering pump; 19,20,21,22 mass flow meter; 23 water tank	150
Figure 4.4.3	Correlation between support acidity and H ₂ yield for improved catalyst design for ethanol reforming.....	151
Figure 4.5.1	Schematic of the chemical looping combustion (CLC) process	152
Figure 4.5.2	Schematic of the chemical looping hydrogen (CLH) process	154
Figure 4.5.3	Schematic of the three-reactor chemical looping hydrogen (CLH) process.....	155
Figure 4.5.4	Schematic of the coal-direct chemical looping gasification (CDCL) process for H ₂ production from coal	156
Figure 4.5.5	Schematic of the syngas chemical looping (SCL) process for H ₂ production from coal.....	156
Figure 4.5.6	Exergy analysis for conventional coal gasification vs. chemical looping gasification	157
Figure 4.5.7	Schematic of the chemical looping reforming (CLR) process.....	159
Figure 4.5.8	Schematic diagram of the chemical looping combustion – steam reforming (CLC-SMR) process	160
Figure 4.5.9	Schematic of the cyclic CLDRM	160
Figure 4.5.10	Agglomerates formed in the fuel reactor. Square size = 5 mm.....	164

Figure 4.5.11 Schematic of calcium looping process (CLP)..... 166
Figure 4.5.12 Schematic representation of the Ca–Cu chemical looping concept for hydrogen production 167
Figure 4.5.13 Integration of the Calcium Looping Process with coal gasification 167

TABLES

Table ES-1 Summary of Hydrogen Production Processes Performance xxvi
Table 1.4.1 Review of catalysts being researched for RWGS (Chen 2016)..... 6
Table 1.5.1 Fuel Cell Comparison Fact Sheet (energy.gov/eere/fuelcells/comparison-fuel-cell-technologies)..... 8
Table 2.2.1 Global exergy flows and efficiency of SMR based on Fan et al. (2016). 19
Table 2.5.1 Hydrogen production from Au-doped TiO₂ photocatalysts (Murdoch et al., 2011) 38
Table 3.1.1 H₂ Production vs. Relative Cost for H₂ PSA (Van Dyke, 2013) 57
Table 3.3.1 H₂ Permselectivity of Select Polymers 67
Table 3.3.2 Ube Polyimide H₂ Membrane Performance (Ho & Sirkar, 1992) 67
Table 4.1.1 Summary of Metal Oxide Based Thermochemical Cycles Efficiencies (Yadav and Banerjee, 2016) 86
Table 4.1.2 Summary of Costs and Maximum Size of Thermochemical Cycles with Potential Commercial Application (Yadav and Banerjee, 2016)..... 95
Table 4.3.1 Reactions at the Electrode for Alkaline and PEM Electrolyzers 116
Table 4.3.2 Claimed Performance of Commercial Alkaline Electrolyzers..... 121
Table 4.3.3 Claimed Performance of Commercial PEM Electrolyzers 124
Table 4.3.4 Cathode and Anode Electrocatalysts for Water Electrolysis Systems 126
Table 4.3.5 Specifications of common electrolysis techniques (Bhandari et al., 2014; Smolinka et al., 2014) 128
Table 4.3.6 Onboard Hydrogen Storage for Light-Duty Fuel Cell Vehicles (US Department of Energy, 2017)..... 129
Table 4.3.7 Hydrogen via Electrolysis Routes: Lab, Pilot and Demonstration Projects (adapted from Gahleitner, 2013)..... 131
Table 4.3.8 Scenarios Assumed for the Calculation of Costs Shown in Figure 4.3.1.0 ... 135
Table 4.3.9 Estimated Operational Expenses, OPEX, per kg of H₂..... 136
Table 4.3.10 Input-output balance of a wind-electrolysis system for the production of hydrogen (Spath and Mann, 2004)..... 138
Table 4.3.11 Summary of Water Electrolysis Processes for Hydrogen Production 145

Table 4.5.1	Comparison of Process Efficiency, Based on (Fan and Li, 2010b; Li et al., 2010a).....	157
Table 4.5.2	Oxygen carriers vs CL processes (Protasova & Snijkers 2016)	163