

# SYSTEM PERSPECTIVES/NET GHG BENEFIT OF CO<sub>2</sub> CONVERSION TECHNOLOGIES

A techno-economic investigation  
commissioned by the members of the  
**Carbon Dioxide Capture & Conversion (CO<sub>2</sub>CC) Program**

Client Private  
December 2016



### **The Carbon Dioxide Capture & Conversion (CO<sub>2</sub>CC) Program**

The **CO<sub>2</sub>CC Program** is a membership-directed consortium whose members are involved in the development, monitoring and utilization of the “state-of-the-art” in technological progress and commercial implementation of carbon dioxide capture/clean-up and conversion. By the direction of the member companies (through balloting and other interactive means), the program delivers a range of timely and insightful information and analyses which are accessible exclusively to members and protected by confidentiality agreements. The objective is to document technically and commercially viable options for CO<sub>2</sub> capture/clean-up as well as its conversion into useful products which meaningfully address the challenges posed by CO<sub>2</sub> life-cycle and overall sustainability issues.

Members receive three in-depth **CO<sub>2</sub>CC Techno-economic Reports** which are written by leading scientists and experienced industry professionals in areas selected by the membership (via ballot); weekly *CO<sub>2</sub>CC Communiqués* (delivered via e-mail) which provide the latest updates on technical breakthroughs, commercial events and exclusive development opportunities; and attendance at the CO<sub>2</sub>CC Program **Annual Meeting**.

The **Carbon Dioxide Capture & Conversion (CO<sub>2</sub>CC) Program** is available on a membership basis from The Catalyst Group Resources (TCGR). For further details, please contact John J. Murphy at [John.J.Murphy@catalystgrp.com](mailto:John.J.Murphy@catalystgrp.com) or +1.215.628.4447 (x1121).



P.O. Box 680  
Spring House, PA 19477 U.S.A  
ph: +1.215.628.4447

## CONTENTS

<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b> .....	<b>xxvii</b>
<b>1. INTRODUCTION</b> .....	<b>1</b>
1.1 MEGATREND SUSTAINABILITY .....	1
1.2 SOURCES OF CARBON DIOXIDE .....	3
1.3 CARBON DIOXIDE AS RAW MATERIAL .....	5
1.4 TARGETS IN CARBON DIOXIDE UTILIZATION .....	6
1.4.1 Choice of Chemical Targets.....	6
1.4.2 Interphase of Energy Sector and Chemical Industry.....	10
1.4.3 Selection of Case Studies .....	10
1.5 LIFE CYCLE ASSESSMENT AS EVALUATION TOOL.....	11
1.6 AUTHORS & CONTRIBUTORS .....	13
1.7 REFERENCES.....	14
<b>2. CASE STUDY 1 – SYNGAS PRODUCTION VIA DRY REFORMING</b> .....	<b>17</b>
2.1 TECHNICAL AND COMMERCIAL NATURE OF THE CURRENT APPROACH .....	17
2.2 TECHNICAL AND COMMERCIAL NATURE OF THE CO <sub>2</sub> -BASED APPROACH...	20
2.2.1 Dry Reforming .....	20
2.2.2 Catalysts and Technology .....	22
2.2.3 State of the Art and Pilot Plant Operations .....	23
2.3 VIABILITY AND IMPACT .....	23
2.3.1 Life-cycle-assessment .....	23
2.3.2 The Economic Viability .....	23
2.3.3 Impacts of the Opportunities .....	24
2.3.4 Challenges that Need to be Addressed in the Future .....	24
2.4 REFERENCES.....	25
<b>3. CASE STUDY 2 – METHANOL PRODUCTION ON BASIS OF CO<sub>2</sub></b> .....	<b>27</b>
3.1 TECHNICAL AND COMMERCIAL NATURE OF THE CURRENT APPROACH .....	28
3.2 TECHNICAL AND COMMERCIAL NATURE OF THE CO <sub>2</sub> -BASED APPROACH...	31
3.2.1 Catalysts and Technology .....	31

3.2.2	State of the Art and Pilot Plant Operations .....	32
3.3	VIABILITY AND IMPACT .....	33
3.3.1	Life Cycle Assessment .....	33
3.3.2	The Economic Viability .....	34
3.3.3	Impacts of the Opportunities .....	35
3.3.4	Challenges that Need to be Addressed in the Future .....	37
3.4	REFERENCES .....	37
<b>4.</b>	<b>CASE STUDY 3 – CO<sub>2</sub>-BASED METHANATION.....</b>	<b>41</b>
4.1	TECHNICAL AND COMMERCIAL NATURE OF THE CURRENT APPROACH .....	41
4.2	TECHNICAL AND COMMERCIAL NATURE OF THE CO <sub>2</sub> -BASED APPROACH.....	42
4.2.1	Catalysts and Technology .....	43
4.2.2	State of the Art and Pilot Plant Operations .....	47
4.3	VIABILITY AND IMPACT .....	47
4.3.1	Life Cycle Assessment .....	47
4.3.2	The Economic Viability .....	48
4.3.3	Impacts of the Opportunities .....	49
4.3.4	Challenges that Need to be Addressed in the Future .....	50
4.4	REFERENCES .....	50
<b>5.</b>	<b>CASE STUDY 4 – CO<sub>2</sub>-BASED FISCHER-TROPSCH PRODUCTION OF FUELS AND CHEMICALS .....</b>	<b>55</b>
5.1	TECHNICAL AND COMMERCIAL NATURE OF THE CURRENT APPROACH .....	55
5.2	TECHNICAL AND COMMERCIAL NATURE OF THE CO <sub>2</sub> -BASED APPROACH.....	56
5.2.1	Catalysts and Technology .....	57
5.2.2	State of the Art and Pilot Plant Operations .....	58
5.3	VIABILITY AND IMPACT .....	58
5.3.1	Life Cycle Assessment .....	58
5.3.2	The Economic Viability .....	60
5.3.3	Impacts of the Opportunities .....	61
5.3.4	Challenges that Need to be Addressed in the Future .....	62
5.4	REFERENCES .....	62
<b>6.</b>	<b>CASE STUDY 5 – CO<sub>2</sub>-BASED POLYCARBONATE AND POLYURETHANE PRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>65</b>
6.1	TECHNICAL AND COMMERCIAL NATURE OF THE CURRENT APPROACH .....	65
6.1.1	Synthetic Route to Molecular Carbonates.....	65

6.1.2	Synthetic Route to Aromatic Polycarbonates.....	67
6.1.3	Synthetic Route to Aliphatic Polycarbonates.....	68
6.2	TECHNICAL AND COMMERCIAL NATURE OF THE CO <sub>2</sub> -BASED APPROACH...	68
6.2.1	Synthetic Route to Molecular Carbonates.....	68
6.2.2	Synthetic Route to Aromatic Polycarbonates.....	70
6.2.3	Synthetic Route to Aliphatic Polycarbonates.....	71
6.2.4	State of the Art and Pilot Plant Operations .....	71
6.3	VIABILITY AND IMPACT.....	72
6.3.1	Life-cycle-assessment .....	72
6.3.2	The Economic Viability .....	73
6.3.3	Impacts of the Opportunities.....	74
6.3.4	Challenges that Need to be Addressed in the Future .....	75
6.4	REFERENCES.....	75
<b>7.</b>	<b>CASE STUDY 6 – CO<sub>2</sub>-BASED CEMENT PRODUCTION AND MINERAL CARBONATION.....</b>	<b>79</b>
7.1	POTENTIAL MARKET VOLUMES IN THE CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRIES .....	79
7.2	PROCESSES BASED ON CO <sub>2</sub> - CURRENT STATE OF THE ART.....	80
7.2.1	Alternative Binders .....	80
7.2.2	Mineral Carbonation .....	81
7.2.3	Implementation of Carbon Capture and Storage.....	82
7.2.4	State of the Art and Pilot Plant Operations .....	82
7.3	VIABILITY AND IMPACT.....	83
7.3.1	Life Cycle Assessment.....	83
7.3.2	The Economic Viability .....	84
7.3.3	Impacts of the Opportunities.....	84
7.3.4	Challenges that Need to be Addressed in the Future .....	85
7.4	REFERENCES.....	85
<b>8.</b>	<b>CONCLUSIONS.....</b>	<b>89</b>
8.1	POTENTIAL OF CO <sub>2</sub> CONVERSION TECHNOLOGIES.....	89
8.1.1	Comparison of CCU and CCS Technologies.....	89
8.1.2	Power-to-gas Technologies.....	90
8.2	SYSTEM PERSPECTIVES/NET GHG BENEFIT.....	91
8.2.1	Availability of Renewable Energy .....	91
8.2.2	Efficiency of CO <sub>2</sub> Conversion.....	94

8.2.3	Hydrogen Production with Electricity from Renewable Sources .....	95
8.2.4	Application Pathways for Power-to-Fuel Systems.....	95
8.2.5	Comparison of Technologies .....	96
8.2.6	Closing the Loop.....	97
8.3	REFERENCES.....	97
<b>9.</b>	<b>INDEX.....</b>	<b>101</b>

## FIGURES

Figure ES.1	Selected examples of the manifold applications of CO <sub>2</sub> in the production of value-added chemicals (Peters and Köhler 2011).....	xxviii
Figure 1.2.1	Large point sources in Europe (left) and concentration of CO <sub>2</sub> in the atmosphere (right), adapted from (Canadell and Quéré 2007, von der Assen and Müller 2016).....	3
Figure 1.2.2	Material and energy balance for the separation of 1 t of carbon dioxide from the flue gas stream of a coal-fired power station via amine scrubbing; adapted from (Guandalini and Campanari 2015).....	4
Figure 1.2.3	Feedstock used in the operational biogas systems in the U.S. (American Biogas Council 2016).....	5
Figure 1.4.1.1	Figure of merits for evaluating the potential of CO <sub>2</sub> capture technologies (left) sharpening the evaluation criteria (right) stated in (Peters and Köhler 2011).....	8
Figure 1.4.2.1	Energy density of common energy carriers.....	10
Figure 1.5.1	General concept of life-cycle-assessment taking into account all stages during the lifetime of a product from the extraction of the raw materials (cradle), production, transport, use to recycling and disposal (grave); adapted from (von der Assen and Voll 2014) .....	12
Figure 2.1.1	Flow scheme for syngas production by steam reforming of natural gas; adapted from (Moulijn and Makkee 2001) .....	19
Figure 2.1.2	Flow scheme for syngas production by autothermic reforming; adapted from (Moulijn and Makkee 2001).....	19
Figure 2.1.3	Processing of raw syngas .....	20

Figure 2.2.1.1	Influence of temperature on the equilibrium composition of dry reforming of CO <sub>2</sub> with natural gas; initial gas composition: CO <sub>2</sub> /CH <sub>4</sub> = 1/1; adapted from (Pakhare and Spivey 2014).....	21
Figure 3.1.1	Equilibrium conversion in the synthesis of methanol with a feed of CO/H <sub>2</sub> of 1/2; adapted from (Moulijn and Makkee 2001).....	29
Figure 3.1.2	TEM images of Cu/ZnO recorded in situ at 220°C under the atmosphere stated and corresponding Wulff constructions showing the change of the Cu nanoparticle shape with the gas environment; adapted from (Hansen and Wagner 2002).....	30
Figure 3.1.3	Increased activity of the Cu/ZnO/Al <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub> catalyst after transient switch-off of the CO <sub>2</sub> component in the feed; CO : CO <sub>2</sub> : H <sub>2</sub> : N <sub>2</sub> = 5 : 5 : 88 : 2, flow reactor, T = 220°C, p = 63 bar, adapted from (Chorkendorff and Niemantsverdriet 2007).....	30
Figure 3.2.1	Combination of the CO <sub>2</sub> -based synthesis of methanol with the oxy-fuel technology.....	32
Figure 3.3.1.1	Material and energy balance for the production of 1 t methanol from carbon dioxide; adapted from (Pérez-Fortes and Schöneberger 2016).....	34
Figure 3.3.3.1	Simulated operation characteristics for the use of electricity generated in a coal power plant with integrated power-to-methanol production; the numbers are for a future plant with a size of 12.1 MWh electricity-to-grid and 6.6 MWh power-to-methanol (Mitsubishi Hitachi Power Systems Europe and Carbon Recycling International 2015).....	37
Figure 4.1.1	Influence of pressure (left, data for 300 °C) and temperature (right, data for 1 bar) on the equilibrium composition of the CO <sub>2</sub> methanation reaction; initial gas composition: CO <sub>2</sub> /H <sub>2</sub> = 0.2/0.8; adapted from (Rönsch and Schneider 2016).....	42
Figure 4.2.1	Material and energy balance for the production of methane equivalent to 1 MJ via the Sabatier process, adapted from (Guandalini and Campanari 2015).....	43
Figure 4.2.1.1	Principle of integrating electrolysis systems and gas turbines into a grid with fluctuating power supply; adapted from (Guandalini and Campanari 2015).....	44
Figure 4.2.1.2	Process chain of the power-to-gas technology; adapted from (Götz and Lefebvre 2016).....	45
Figure 4.2.1.3	System from renewable energy via power-to-gas to application; adapted from (Reiter and Lindorfer 2015).....	46
Figure 4.2.1.4	Integrating biomethane or biogas production via power-to-gas technologies into the gas grid.....	46
Figure 5.1.1	Product distribution in Fischer-Tropsch in dependence of the chain growth probability $\alpha$ ; adapted from (Dimitriou and Garcia-Gutierrez 2015).....	56

Figure 5.2.1.1	The more effective binding configuration of the surface intermediates leads to higher selectivity in Fischer-Tropsch upon doping with Na <sub>2</sub> S or Na <sub>2</sub> O, adapted from (Xie and Yang 2016).....	57
Figure 5.3.1.1	Configuration of the technology used in the analysis of the energy efficiency of fuel production from solar energy; adapted from (van der Giesen and Kleijn 2014).....	59
Figure 5.3.1.2	Energy efficiency (left) and global warming potential (right) of fuel production in dependence of the energy source used for electricity production and the source of CO <sub>2</sub> ; calculated for the configuration shown in Figure 5.3.1. (van der Giesen and Kleijn 2014).....	59
Figure 5.3.1.3	GHG emissions per unit energy output for fuels derived from bioenergy carriers (red bars) compared to fuels derived from fossil energy carriers (blue bars); adapted from (Edenhofer and Pichs-Madruga 2012). ....	60
Figure 5.3.2.1	Configuration for the conversion of biomass into fuel; MEA, monoethanolamine, adapted from (Dimitriou and Garcia-Gutierrez 2015). ....	61
Figure 6.1.2.1	Consumption of polycarbonate resins; adapted from (2016, Xie and Yang 2016).....	68
Figure 6.2.2.1	Asahi Kasei’s new process for the production of bisphenol-A polycarbonate by-passes intermediate ethylene carbonate in the formation of open chain dialkylcarbonates, adapted from (Thayer 2015).....	70
Figure 8.2.1.1	Global distribution of the yearly averaged downward solar radiation (left, in W/m <sup>2</sup> ) and the yearly averaged wind speed (right, in m/s); adapted from (Jacobson 2010).....	93
Figure 8.2.1.2	Cost of electricity (top) and fuels (bottom) generated by the use of renewable primary energy sources and commercially available technologies (red and blue bars) in comparison to the cost using fossil primary energy sources (range marked in orange); prices in US\$ 2005 (Edenhofer and Pichs-Madruga 2012).....	94

## TABLES

Table D.1	Definition of Technology Readiness Level Used in this Study.....	xxv
Table D.2	Traffic Light System Applied in this Study in Evaluating the Attractiveness of a Particular CO <sub>2</sub> -Based Technology.....	xxv
Table ES.1	Case Studies Selected to Discuss the Potential of CO <sub>2</sub> -Based Technologies Comparing the Current Technological Approach to Fuels, Commodity Chemicals and Materials with the Corresponding CO <sub>2</sub> -Based Technology....	xxxi



Table 1.1.1	Selected Key Figures on the Generation of CO <sub>2</sub> and the Impact of CCU Technologies (figures refer to 2014) .....	2
Table 1.1.2	Price Estimates on the Production of Selected Commodities from CO <sub>2</sub> .....	2
Table 1.1.3	Classification of Co-Reagents Used in CO <sub>2</sub> Utilization According to Simplicity and the Need to Use an Additional Energy Supply.....	3
Table 1.4.1.1	Products Obtained at Present with the Use of CO <sub>2</sub> as Feedstock, Production Volume and Amount of CO <sub>2</sub> Fixed in the Product.....	7
Table 1.4.3.1	Case Studies Selected for Discussing the Potential of CO <sub>2</sub> -Based Technologies.....	11
Table 2.1.1	Large scale applications of syngas in dependence of the gas composition with characteristic ratio of carbon monoxide and hydrogen.....	17
Table 2.3.3.1	Comparison of the current approach and the CO <sub>2</sub> -based approach for syngas generation.....	24
Table 3.3.3.1	Comparison of the current approach and the CO <sub>2</sub> -based approach in methanol production .....	36
Table 4.3.2.1	Investment for a power-to-gas plant detailed to the main components . .....	49
Table 4.3.3.1	Comparison of the current approach and the CO <sub>2</sub> -based approach in CO <sub>2</sub> methanation.....	50
Table 5.3.3.1	Comparison of the current approach and the CO <sub>2</sub> -based approach .....	62
Table 6.3.3.1	Comparison of the current approach and the CO <sub>2</sub> -based approach .....	74
Table 7.3.3.1	Comparison of the current approach and the CO <sub>2</sub> -based approach .....	85
Table 8.2.1.1	Overview on the potential of alternative energy sources.....	92
Table 8.2.3.1	Key operation parameters of current and future electrolysis technologies.....	95
Table 8.2.5.1	Estimated CO <sub>2</sub> utilization potential by relating the recent annual demand (market volume) with the amount of CO <sub>2</sub> fixed in the product (specific CO <sub>2</sub> content). .....	96