

**STATE OF THE ART AND FUTURE PROSPECTS FOR
CATALYTIC AND ELECTROCHEMICAL ROUTES TO
CO₂ CONVERSION**

A techno-economic investigation
commissioned by the members of the
Carbon Dioxide Capture & Conversion (CO₂CC) Program

Client Private
July 2022



The Carbon Dioxide Capture & Conversion (CO₂CC) Program

The **CO₂CC Program** is a membership-directed consortium whose members are involved in the development, monitoring and utilization of the “state-of-the-art” in technological progress and commercial implementation of carbon dioxide capture/clean-up and conversion. By the direction of the member companies (through balloting and other interactive means), the program delivers a range of timely and insightful information and analyses which are accessible exclusively to members and protected by confidentiality agreements. The objective is to document technically and commercially viable options for CO₂ capture/clean-up as well as its conversion into useful products which meaningfully address the challenges posed by CO₂ life-cycle and overall sustainability issues.

Members receive three in-depth **CO₂CC Techno-economic Reports** which are written by leading scientists and experienced industry professionals in areas selected by the membership (via ballot); weekly *CO₂CC Communiqués* (delivered via e-mail) which provide the latest updates on technical breakthroughs, commercial events and exclusive development opportunities; and attendance at the CO₂CC Program **Annual Meeting**.

The **Carbon Dioxide Capture & Conversion (CO₂CC) Program** is available on a membership basis from The Catalyst Group Resources (TCGR). For further details, please contact Chris Dziedziak at cdziedziak@catalystgrp.com or +1.215.628.4447.



P.O. Box 680
Spring House, PA 19477 U.S.A.
ph: +1.215.628.4447
www.catalystgrp.com

CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	xxiii
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 NEED FOR THE STUDY	1
1.2 SCOPE OF THE REPORT	1
1.3 SOURCES OF CO ₂	1
1.4 CO ₂ UTILISATION VALUE CHAINS.....	2
1.5 AUTHORS & CONTRIBUTORS	2
2. CATALYTIC CONVERSION OF CO₂ (NON-POWER-TO-X).....	5
2.1 CLIMATE CHANGE AND THE CIRCULAR ECONOMY	5
2.1.1 The Carbon Circular Economy	5
2.1.2 The Need for a Man-made Carbon Cycle	6
2.2 THERMODYNAMIC AND KINETIC CHALLENGES IN CO ₂ CONVERSION	7
2.3 THE ROLE OF METAL CENTERS (CATALYSTS) IN CO ₂ ACTIVATION.....	9
2.3.1 Carbon Dioxide as O-Nucleophile	10
2.3.2 Carbon Dioxide as C-Electrophile	10
2.3.3 Amphoteric Reactivity of Carbon Dioxide	10
2.3.4 The Carbon Dioxide Radical Anion, CO ₂ ⁻	11
2.3.5 The Carbon Dioxide Radical Cation, CO ₂ ⁺	12
2.3.6 Spectroscopic Techniques Applied to the CO ₂ States.....	12
2.4 CO ₂ QUALITY STANDARDS FOR CO ₂ UTILIZATION	14
2.4.1 Physical and Catalytic Routes for CO ₂ Purification.....	16
2.5 CO ₂ AS BUILDING BLOCK FOR CHEMICALS	16
2.5.1 Low Energy Processes.....	16
2.5.2 Synthesis of Urea.....	17
2.5.3 Production of Inorganic Carbonates	17
2.5.4 Synthesis of Formic Acid by Direct Catalytic CO ₂ Hydrogenation.....	17
2.5.5 Insertion of CO ₂ into the C-H bond: Synthesis of Carboxylic Acids.....	20
2.5.6 Reaction with Olefins and Dienes (Energy Rich Species)	21
2.5.7 Reaction with Alkynes	23
2.5.8 Synthesis of Oxalates	23
2.5.9 Synthesis of Organic Carbonates, Linear and Cyclic.....	24

PROPRIETARY -- Do Not Reproduce or Redistribute!

This message is in red ink. If not, you have an unauthorized copy.

2.5.10 Synthesis of Urethanes	25
2.5.11 Other Reactions	26
2.6 CO ₂ AS CO-MONOMER.....	27
2.6.1 Synthesis of Polycarbonates.....	27
2.6.2 Synthesis of Polyurethanes.....	31
2.7 CO ₂ AS SOURCE OF CARBON FOR ENERGY PRODUCTS.....	32
2.7.1 The Hydrogen and Energy Traps	32
2.7.2 Thermal Reactions Using Syngas	34
2.7.3 Innovative Approach to Fuels from CO ₂	42
2.8 TECHNO-ECONOMIC CHALLENGES.....	48
2.8.1 Point-source CO ₂ Capture: Fossil and Bio Sources	48
2.8.2 Direct Air Capture	49
2.8.3 CO ₂ to Chemicals and Materials	50
2.8.4 CO ₂ to Energy Products	51
2.8.5 Need for a System Approach: Integration of Industries and Processes	52
2.8.6 Examples of Value-chains.....	53
2.8.7 Assessment of Products and Processes by LCA and SE-LCA.....	54
2.8.8 Catalysts Requirements (Availability, Cost, Performance, Durability and Recycling)	55
2.9 SUMMARY AND OUTLOOK.....	56
2.10 REFERENCES	57
3. ELECTROCATALYTIC CONVERSION OF CO₂	69
3.1 INTRODUCTION	69
3.1.1 Thermodynamic and Kinetic Challenges	70
3.1.2 The Role of the Solvent, of the Supporting Electrolyte and of Other Key Operative Parameters	72
3.2 ELECTROCHEMICAL CONVERSION OF CO ₂ TO DIFFERENT TARGET PRODUCTS.....	79
3.2.1 Electrosynthesis of CO	80
3.2.2 Co-Electrolysis of Water and CO ₂ to Syngas.....	81
3.2.3 Electrosynthesis of Formic Acid/Formate.....	83
3.2.4 Electrosynthesis of Hydrocarbons.....	84
3.2.5 Other Electrosynthesis.....	86

PROPRIETARY -- Do Not Reproduce or Redistribute!

This message is in red ink. If not, you have an unauthorized copy.

3.3 TECHNO-ECONOMIC CHALLENGES	88
3.3.1 General Considerations	88
3.3.2 Catalyst Requirements.....	89
3.3.3 Reactors and Productivity Requirements	91
3.3.4 Techno-economic Perspectives	91
3.4 SUMMARY AND OUTLOOK	94
3.5 REFERENCES.....	94
4. BIOLOGICAL CONVERSION OF CO₂.....	103
4.1 INTRODUCTION	103
4.2 BIOLOGICAL CONVERSION OF CO ₂ TO CHEMICALS, MATERIALS, AND FUELS	103
4.2.1 Photosynthetic Routes	104
4.2.2 Non-photosynthetic Routes	118
4.2.3 Others	122
4.3 BIOLOGICAL CONVERSION OF CO ₂ TO PROTEINS	124
4.3.1 Proteins from Aquatic Biomass.....	124
4.3.2 Proteins from Microbes and Renewable Energy	125
4.4 BIOLOGICAL (MICROBIAL) CONVERSION OF CO ₂ TO POLYMERS	127
4.4.1 Polyhydroxyalkanoates (PHAs)	127
4.4.2 Polysaccharides	129
4.5 TECHNO-ECONOMIC CHALLENGES	129
4.6 SUMMARY AND OUTLOOK	130
4.7 REFERENCES.....	131
5. MICROBIAL ELECTROSYNTHESIS OF MOLECULES FROM CO₂	139
5.1 INTRODUCTION TO MICROBIAL ELECTROSYNTHESIS (MES).....	139
5.2 BACKGROUND AND MOTIVATION.....	141
5.3 MES FOR CO ₂ CONVERSION	143
5.4 MES COMPONENTS AND PROCESS PARAMETERS	143
5.5 MES EVOLUTION AND TIMELINE OF MAJOR DEVELOPMENTS.....	145
5.6 MES OF CO ₂ TO CHEMICALS & FUELS	146
5.6.1 Acetic Acid.....	146
5.6.2 Medium Chain Fatty Acids (MCFAs).....	146
5.6.3 Other Volatile Fatty Acids (VFAs)	147

5.6.4	Alcohols	147
5.6.5	Methane	147
5.6.6	Others	148
5.7.	MES OF CO ₂ TO POLYMERS	149
5.7.1	Direct Routes.....	149
5.7.2	Indirect Routes	150
5.8.	DOWNSTREAM PROCESSING IN MES	153
5.9	TECHNO-ECONOMIC CHALLENGES	153
5.9.1	Technological Readiness Level (TRL) for Different MES Products	154
5.9.2	Key Challenges for Upscaling & Commercialization.....	155
5.10	SUMMARY AND OUTLOOK	156
5.11	REFERENCES	157
6.	INDEX	163
	APPENDIX	165

FIGURES

Figure ES-1	Perspective use of CO ₂ that can be converted into chemicals and fuels. Short term: 5-7 y; Medium term: 8-12 y; Long term: 15+ y	xxiii
Figure 2.1	Gibbs-Free Energy (ΔG°_f) of CO ₂ and some other C ₁ -molecules. Organic carbonates and carbamates lay within the blue-circle, inorganic carbonates (CO ₃ ²⁻) are lower in energy, all other species are higher in energy. In order to convert CO ₂ in any species lying above it, energy must be provided, represented by the blue segment in the Figure. Often, hydrogen is also needed ...	7
Figure 2.2	Ground state geometry and dipole moments in the carbon dioxide molecule	8
Figure 2.3a	Schematic view of the CO ₂ molecular orbitals: white and black indicate the positive and negative sign of the wave function.....	8
Figure 2.3b	Change of the orbital energy moving from the linear to the bent (90°) geometry. (Simplified Walsh Diagram)	9
Figure 2.4	Lewis Acid – Base Properties of CO ₂ . A is a Lewis Acid, D is a Lewis Base	9
Figure 2.5	Side-on coordination of CO ₂ to a metal center	10
Figure 2.6	Normal vibration modes of the carbon dioxide molecule in its ground state	12

PROPRIETARY -- Do Not Reproduce or Redistribute!

This message is in red ink. If not, you have an unauthorized copy.

Figure 2.7	Fluxionality of CO ₂ in Ni(PCy ₃) ₂ (CO ₂) (M=Ni, L ₁ =L ₂ =PCy ₃).....	14
Figure 2.8	Carbamic acid (monomer and dimer) and carbamic esters	26
Figure 2.9	Methanol as chemical feedstock.....	35
Figure 2.10	Process flow diagram for single-step DME synthesis from coal/natural gas	39
Figure 2.11	Photochemical reduction of CO ₂ in water in presence of a photocatalyst. (P =photosensitizer; Θ=charge transfer system; C+ =oxidation catalytic center; C- =Reduction catalytic center).....	43
Figure 2.12	The re-complex used by JM Lehn for CO ₂ photo-reduction.....	43
Figure 2.13	How a semiconductor (solid photocatalyst) works (A). Comparison of conductors, semiconductors and insulators (B). E _F =Fermi energy; E _G =Energy gap.	44
Figure 2.14	Graphene oxide-GO loaded with CuO (bright spots) as photocatalyst for C-H carboxylation at room temperature under Vis-light irradiation. GO has itself some photocatalytic properties, much enhanced by CuO, and acts as CO ₂ absorption medium and light adsorber.....	45
Figure 2.15	TEM view of commercial (a) and nanosized CuI prepared in the laboratory. The former produces only a small amount of CO in the photochemical reduction of CO ₂ in isopropanol under visible light irradiation, the latter produces HCO ₂ H with an interesting selectivity (right). The product distribution is shown on the right which also shows that ¹ H-NMR (right, upper) and Gas-chromatography (right, lower) can be used to quantify the products as they are formed	46
Figure 2.16	Band gap (on the left) of some semiconductors and energy required in CO ₂ reduction to selected products (on the right)	47
Figure 2.17	Perspective use of CO ₂ that can be converted into chemicals and fuels: short term: 5-7 y; medium term: 8-12 y; long term: 15+ y	56
Figure 3.1	Main products obtained by CO ₂ electrochemical reduction.....	69
Figure 3.2	Examples of cells. A) Photo of flow cell; B) Scheme of filter-press flow cell; C) filter press flow cell with a continuous recirculation of pressurized solution	79
Figure 4.1	WTI crude oil prices - 10 year daily chart.....	105
Figure 4.2	Scenedesmus obliquus PF3 used for the biological removal of nitric oxide (NO) and carbon dioxide	106
Figure 4.3	Tubular and plate photobioreactors	107
Figure 4.4	Photovoltaic (PV) filters integrated with a photobioreactor	108
Figure 4.5	Phytonix CO ₂ conversion to butanol	109
Figure 4.6	Joule Technology	110

Figure 4.7	a) Schematic representation of Joule technology; b) Helioculture	111
Figure 4.8	The natural C-cycle	112
Figure 4.9	Major components of lignocellulosic biomass.....	113
Figure 4.10	Bioethanol production steps	114
Figure 4.11	Biogas production steps	115
Figure 4.12	Technologies to produce vanillin	117
Figure 4.13	Chemical structure of isoprene and classification of terpenes	118
Figure 4.14	Wood-Ljungdahl pathway (WLP).....	119
Figure 4.15	Integrated process to produce methane from CO ₂	120
Figure 4.16	Bioconversion of waste coal	120
Figure 4.17	Production of chemicals from carbon dioxide in <i>E. coli</i>	121
Figure 4.18	<i>E. coli</i> bacteria engineered CO ₂ fixation.....	122
Figure 4.19	Production of fatty acid by engineered <i>Yarrowia lipolytica</i>	123
Figure 4.20	Metabolic pathways of engineered <i>Pichia pastoris</i>	123
Figure 4.21	Two steps process to convert CO ₂ into proteins	126
Figure 4.22	Oakbio technology	126
Figure 4.23	Ways to use CO ₂ for polymers	127
Figure 4.24	General structure of polyhydroxyalkanoate (PHA) and examples of their structural derivatives	128
Figure 4.25	Commercial application of PHAs	128
Figure 4.26	Global biofuel production 2019 and forecast to 2025	130
Figure 5.1	Schematic of a microbial electrosynthesis (MES) system and working principle (A). The key electron transfer processes that are integral to MES are shown in B. In the direct electron uptake/transfer process, microorganisms attach to the cathode and directly take up electrons from it, whereas indirect electron transfer involves the transport of electrons by diffusible electron carriers such as H ₂ , formate, ammonia (either produced electrochemically or added to the reactors externally) or redox mediators (produced by microbes or added externally) from the cathode to microbes. For instance, the H ₂ evolution occurs at -0.41 cathode potential (<i>vs</i> SHE) under the conditions of pH 7, 1 atm pressure, and temperature of 25 °C. [VFAs: Volatile fatty acids, PHB: Polyhydroxybutyrate, SHE: Standard Hydrogen Electrode].....	140
Figure 5.2	The bibliometric data for the number of scientific publications with 'microbial electrosynthesis' in the title, abstract and keywords	141

PROPRIETARY -- Do Not Reproduce or Redistribute!

This message is in red ink. If not, you have an unauthorized copy.

Figure 5.3	Why microbial electrosynthesis (MES)? An illustration showing the key advantages of the MES process over other bio-based (such as algae cultivation and gas fermentation) and chemical catalysis-based production platforms	142
Figure 5.4	Key MES components (A) and process parameters/performance indicators (B).....	144
Figure 5.5	Timeline depicting the major developments of MES from CO ₂	145

TABLES

Table ES-1	Strong and Weak Points of Catalysts for the Synthesis of Target Compounds.....	xxiv
Table ES-2	Photosynthetic and Non-photosynthetic Platforms for Biological CO ₂ Conversion.....	xxv
Table ES-3	Economic Data on Main Products Obtained by Electrochemical Reduction of Carbon Dioxide.....	xxvi
Table ES-4	Current TRL for Different MES Products from CO ₂ and Key Challenges for Upscaling	xxvii
Table 2.1	Estimated World Fossil-C Reserves (Gtoe, Gigatons Oil-Equivalent)	5
Table 2.2	Vibrational Normal Modes and Related Frequencies (cm ⁻¹) for Neutral, Cationic, and Anionic CO ₂	13
Table 2.3	Reference Composition of Flue Gases After Desulphurization	14
Table 2.4	CO ₂ Stream from Amine Plant Capture (Dakota Plant).....	14
Table 2.5	Purity Requirements for CO ₂ Shipping by Pipeline	15
Table 2.6	Requested Minimum Quality (% Volume) for Several Applications of CO ₂	15
Table 2.7	Thermodynamic Data for the Conversion of CO ₂ and H ₂ into HCO ₂ H Under Various Conditions	18
Table 2.8	Catalysts Used in the Reaction of CO ₂ and H ₂ and Their Performance	19
Table 2.9	Catalysts for Formic Acid Decomposition into CO ₂ and H ₂ and Their Performance.....	20
Table 2.10	Parameters That Influence the Rate of the Polymerization and the Regularity of the Alternate Insertion.....	29
Table 2.11	Comparison of the Cost of Production of 1 kg of H ₂ from Various Sources	33
Table 2.12	Comparison of Catalysts for the Hydrogenation of CO ₂ to Methanol	37
Table 2.13	Comparison of Some Catalysts for Methanation of CO ₂	40
Table 2.14	Catalytic Hydrogenation of CO ₂ Over Various Catalysts.....	42

PROPRIETARY -- Do Not Reproduce or Redistribute!

This message is in red ink. If not, you have an unauthorized copy.

Table 2.15	Potential of Reduction of CO ₂ in Water.....	43
Table 2.16	Actual and Perspective Use of CO ₂ in the Chemical Industry.....	51
Table 2.17	Strong and Weak Points of Catalysts for the Synthesis of Target Compounds ...	55
Table 3.1	Main Products Obtained by Electrochemical Reduction of Carbon Dioxide.	71
Table 3.2	Selected Examples of Publications Concerning the Use of GDE in the CO ₂ RR in Aqueous Solutions.....	73
Table 3.3	Solubility of CO ₂ in Solvents Used for CO ₂ RR	75
Table 3.4	Selected Examples of Publications Concerning the Use of Cu Based Cathodes in the CO ₂ RR in Aqueous Solutions.....	85
Table 3.5	Examples of Achieved Current Density, <i>FE</i> (%), and Energy Efficiency for the Production of Formic Acid, CO and Ethene Compared with Future Expected Values	88
Table 3.6	Economic Data on Main Products Obtained by Electrochemical Reduction of Carbon Dioxide	92
Table 4.1	Microorganisms for the Production of Bioethanol.....	114
Table 4.2	Biomethane Production of Selected Lignocellulosic Biomass	116
Table 4.3	Biological Methods to Obtain Biohydrogen	116
Table 4.4	Proteins Content of Selected Algal Strains	124
Table 4.5	Amino Acid Profile of Selected Algae and Conventional Food (g per 100 g Protein).....	125
Table 4.6	Key Barriers for Commercialization of Bio-based Products from CO ₂	130
Table 5.1	Summary of Different Chemicals and Fuels Obtained from MES of CO ₂	148
Table 5.2	Summary of MES of Biomass (Proteins) and Different Polymers from CO ₂	151
Table 5.3	Technical Matrices for CO ₂ Derived Products in MES	154
Table 5.4	Current TRL for Different MES Products from CO ₂ and Key Challenges for Upscaling	155